DH

ECA/PHSD/HRP/90/13/5.1(ii)(a)

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

Public Administration, Human Resources
and Social Development Division

REPORT TO THE CONFERENCE OF MINISTERS RESPONSIBLE FOR HUMAN RESOURCE PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT AND UTILIZATION ON

THE ECONOMIC CRISIS, STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT AND HIGHER EDUCATION IN AFRICA

NOVEMBER 1990

Executive Summary

1. No single subject in development economics has provoked so much discussion in the 1980s as the social costs and implications of Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs). In fact, structural Adjustment has been a watch-word of the 1980s in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA). There is hardly any African country today that is not implementing an IMF or World Bank programme, or, perhaps, negotiating to have one. Evidence indicates that by the end of 1989, over 30 African countries had acceded to orthodox Structural Adjustment Programmes on the IMF and World Bank terms (ILO/WEP 1989). These programmes call for measures such as currency devaluation, the removal of subsidies on certain consumer goods, reduction in government spending, cost recovery and cost containment in the social services, tax reforms to increase government revenues, etc. Under these programmes, government spending has been drastically curtailed, resulting in profound deterioration in social and economic infrastructures which undermine the very basis of economic recovery. Drastic devaluations of African currencies, for instance, have fueled inflation and undermined the wage incomes in the public sector. Indeed, among African countries that have implemented SAPs during the past decade, none has shown signs that it is ready to graduate and become viable and self-reliant with self-sustaining dynamism. This implies that most of the social and economic progress made since the mid-1960s has been nullified in the 1980s.

2. More often than not, SAPs overlook the distributional aspects of development and the effects on the living standards of the vulnerable groups. Proponents of SAPs argue that the social costs during periods of adjustment are both unavoidable and transitional. There is, therefore, a raging debate on the effect of SAPs on economic growth, their effectiveness in attaining their objectives of restoring economic balance and growth, as well as on their impact on incomes, employment, and living standards as measured by nutrition and health or even education. In fact most, if not all, of the countries which have embarked on SAPs were affected before adjustment, by falling commodity prices, balance of payment problems, the debt burden, etc. However, it cannot be gainsaid that adjustment policies do have social costs.

3. This report will discuss the economic crisis and the impact of Structural Adjustment Programmes on higher education in Africa. Emphasis will be placed on the manner in which SAPs policy measures in the higher education sector have affected the entire education system and the development of the African region. An analysis of the relationship between higher education and socio-economic development will be made.

4. In the first 20 years or so of African independence a massive educational expansion was achieved at a scale that is probably unparalleled in history. The achievement, however, is now being threatened by the rapid population growth, economic crisis and by cut-backs in public expenditure on education. In fact, a reversal of this growth has now set in, in both quantitative and qualitative terms. In addition, higher education in Africa is coming up with problems such as an inappropriate mix of outputs and over-production of poor-quality graduates. Notwithstanding the growing number of graduates and the rising rate of

unemployment among them, there is a scarcity of skilled manpower in the critical fields of science, engineering, management, etc. There is, therefore, an excess of graduates in some disciplines and too few in others. One major explanation for the shortage in high-level skills is the brain drain to the developed countries. In 1985, for instance, the United States alone had more than 34,000 African students many of whom are unlikely to return to Africa. The underlying reason for this migration has been (among other things) an average fall in real incomes of 30% between 1980 and 1989 in the Sub-Saharan Africa which increases the attractiveness of overseas salaries.

5. Given the fact that in many instances the SAPs packages generally include measures such as wage restraint in the formal sector and particularly in the public sector, it goes without saying that SAPs have directly contributed to the brain drain and indirectly to the lowering of quality in higher education. Wage reduction has a disincentive effect and thus reduces productivity of a wage earner of, say, a University level teacher. In fact, this disincentive effects, in most cases, forces wage earners to look for secondary income opportunities to make up for the income loss. This affects the provision of services and contributes to the deterioration of education services.

6. The budget cuts have affected higher education in serveral ways. In Zambia, for instance, the number of students admitted at the University of Zambia (UNZA) is today constrained by the number of places available because there has been no expansion of infrastructure due to budget cuts. This has had a direct negative effect on in-take growth. The budget cuts have also contributed to lack of teaching and research facilities and, shortage of teachers (i.e., high student/instructor ratio). These have affected both job satisfaction among teachers and researchers and therefore, retarded the quality of higher education as well.

7. The IMF/World Bank maintain that budgetary appropriations are relatively much higher for secondary and higher education than for primary education. This could have a perverse effect on long-term development, because primary education contributed more to social equity than any other types of education. They maintain that expanding primary education means better opportunities for rural areas and for the urban poor, while secondary and higher education are more for privileged minorities. While the social utility of primary education expansion is not in question, it must be pointed out that cost-containment measures which result in the gradual removal of subsidies on the social services, through increased fees, especially in the higher-education sector has meant that students from poor households are increasingly unable to pursue their education at this level. This has therefore caused a skewed distribution of income and a concentration of political and economic power among a privileged few who have the capability to pay (Marin and Psacharopaulos 1976: 332-38).

8. This being the case, it has to be recognized that SAPs have not in most cases taken account of their likely social effects and this has been a major cause of their failure. Also, it is the design of these programmes and the speed and sequencing of the reforms they propose that are causing the present controversy.

9. Viewed in this light, it is apparent that short-term approaches to structural adjustment have to be replaced by ones which fully envision the long-term requirements of development. This would mean that SAPs have to be integrated into long-term development planning objectives and not just be seen as temporary devices to cope with passing circumstances.

I. Introduction

10. Africa's crisis is deep seated. Most countries are currently in a precarious economic crisis, whose real severity, dimension, and social and political consequences are not yet fully appreciated even by Africa itself. After the windfall of the commodity price boom in the mid-1970s, most countries have experienced a persistent decline in their terms of trade, caused not only by further import price shocks (such as the second oil shock hike in 1979/80), but also by weak commodity markets (determined in part by the Organization and for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) recession), increases in world interest rates, and a selection of internal shocks, including for many African countries a devastating drought in the early 1980s. In the face of all these largely unfavourable turns of event, African countries have found themselves under increasing pressure from the donor community at large, and the IMF and the World Bank in particular, to make fundamental changes in economic policy. At the macro-level, governments have been asked to adopt more austere fiscal and monetary policies and to adjust exchange rates. But policy reforms have also been applied in other areas. Trade policy reform is perhaps the most remarkable example, with countries being asked to remove quantitative trade control and reduce the levels and dispersion of tariff rates. In addition, Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs)1/ have included policy reforms intended to liberalize domestic product and factor markets. These measures, it is maintained, have been designed to improve resource allocation and to reduce 'X-inefficiency'.2/

11. In 1981, the World Bank published a report on Accelerated Development in Sub-Saharan Africa: An Agenda for Action in which it made an analysis of the causes underlying the present economic difficulties as well as policy recommendations for the 1980s. The World Bank report sparked off a heated debate both in Africa and internationally. A number of seminars and workshops were held at which the relevance and validity of the World Bank analysis were questioned. At the OAU Economic Summit in Lagos in 1980, African States had adopted a common development strategy in "The Lagos Plan of Action for the Implementation of the Monrovian Strategy for the Economic Development of Africa". The Lagos Plan was a result of a series of meetings - Abidjan (1973), Kinshasa (1976) and Monrovia (1979) where the economic situation of Africa and the need for new strategic approaches were addressed. The Lagos Plan of Action is predicated on the fact that Africa's current situation is a direct result of the socio-economic structure created by colonalism. The Plan therefore emphasize the need for collective self-reliance, self-sustaining development and, economic co-operation and integration as essential strategies for transforming this structure.

12. There has also been some recent interest on the effect of these policies on education, particularly on higher education in Africa.3/ The general consensus is that, for the immediate future, the solution to the problem can no longer be in cut-backs in government spending, particularly in the education sector, but rather a consolidation of what has been achieved during the last three decades or so. The gravity of the economic crisis facing Africa has undermined the prospects of sustaining the momentum of normal development planning. Short-term objectives of adjustment must therefore be subsumed under long-term measures in order to avoid a complete breakdown of the entire socio-economic systems.

13. This report will not rehash the economic malaise affecting the developing African countries since the documents on the subject are abundant.4/ Rather, it will analyse some of the assumptions, philosophy and policy directions behind both the IMF/World Bank Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) towards higher education in Africa. The leitmotif of the paper is that, although the very serious and almost intractable economic problems of African countries have been recognized and indeed emphasized in discussions in many international fora, prescriptions for international reform have been too general and global in approach.

14. In short, the main objectives of the report are as follows:

(a) To review the developments and current trends in education in Africa since the early 1960s but particularly from the early 1970s when most of these countries had already attained their political independence in order to make a comparative analysis of the impact of SAPS on higher education in the 1980s;

(b) To examine the circumstances in which most African countries became involved with the programmes of the IMF/World Bank, especially since the early 1980s. Most African countries have been made to cutback on government expenditure in the education sector;

(c) To demonstrate the real impact of these policies and programmes on higher education and social groups in Africa; and

(d) To suggest alternative policies and programmes for recovery in Africa.

II. Trends in education in Africa: 1970-1989

15. Education has long been recognized as a central element in development. The World Bank has shown that the growth in primary school enrolment in Africa during the 1960s and 1970s is probably unparalleled at any other time or place in history.5/ The adult literacy rate increased from the very low level of 9% in 1960 to approximately 42% in 1985. In 1960, only one country - Mauritius - had an adult literacy rate of more than 50%. By mid-1980s, fourteen countries had achieved this benchmark, including Kenya (54%); Ethiopia (55%); Cameroon (56%); Uganda (57%); Zaire (61%); Gabon (63%); Madagascar (68%); Swaziland (68%); Botswana (71%); Lesotho (74%); Zimbabwe (74%); Zambia (76%) and Mauritius (83%). Primary school enrolment increased by an annual growth rate of 7.3% between 1970 and 1980. Enrolment in Secondary and University education rose even faster, growing at an annual rate of 11.9% and 13.1% respectively during the same period (see table 1 below). This happened because most African nations were emphasizing higher education in an effort to alleviate manpower shortages and also because enrolments had started from a low base. In 1960, for instance, there were only about 21,000 University students in Africa (approximately one in 500 of the age group) and a few thousands studying in foreign universities; by early 1980s, 437,000 (seven per 500) were enrolled in African institutions, and a further 100,000 Africans were studying abroad. The trend has now changed.

16. Indeed, the education sector in most African countries has been under severe fiscal and demographic pressure since 1980. Public expenditures on

education have decreased, both in absolute terms as well as relative to national income.6/ Table 1 shows that enrolment in primary-, secondary- and university-level education have weakened to 2.6%, 8.5% and 7.7% respectively. Also, evidence exists to show that there have been declines in schools and University teaching staff in Sub-Saharan Africa between 1980 and 1987 (see Table 2 below). These declines reflect the current economic situation in Africa. By 1980 public expenditure on education in Africa was nearly $10.0 billion. Between 1980 and 1983 public expenditure fell somewhat, down approximately $1.1 billion, to $8.9 billion in constant 1983 dollars. This probably overstates somewhat the decline in real education expenditure since, in most African countries in recent years, teachers' salaries (which constitute approximately 90%, 70% and 50% of recurrent expenditure in primary, secondary and tertiary education, respectively) have not gone up as rapidly as price in general as reflected in the GDP deflator.7/

TABLE 1

Schools and University Enrolment in Developing Africa
1970-1988 (in thousands)

Year	Total	Primary level	as % of Total	Secondary level	as % of Total	University level	as % of Total
1970	34,226	29,371	85.8	4,454	13.0	401	1.2
1975	49,005	40,281	82.2	7,910	16.1	814	1.6
1980	74,297	59,233	79.7	13,685	18.4	1,3474	1.9
1985	90,026	67,469	74.9	20.613	22.9	1,944	2.2
1986	93,672	69,223	73.9	22,365	23.9	2,084	2.2
1987	96,512	70,023	72.6	24.255	25.1	2,234	2.3
1988	100,628	71,844	71.4	26,389	26.2	2,395	2.4
			Percentage Annual Growth Rate				
1970-1980	8.1		7.3		11.9		13.1
1980-185	3.9		2.6		8.5		7.7
1980-1987	3.9		2.6		8.5		7.7

Sources: UNESCO (1987): Statistical Yearbook 1987. Paris.
United Nations (1988): Survey of Economic and Social Conditions in Africa 1986-1987 E/ECA/CM.14/4/Rev.1, pp.81.

It is a fact that higher education is of paramount importance to Africa's future. The continent requires both highly trained people and top quality research so as to be able to formulate the policies, plan the programmes and implement the projects that are essential to economic growth and development. Preparing individuals for positions of responsibility is a central role of the Continent's university while supporting the same individuals in their work - with high quality research, advice and consultancy - is another equally important role.

TABLE 2

Schools and University Teaching Staff in Develping Africa
1970-1988 (in thousands)

Year	Total	Primary level	as % of total	Secondary level	as % of total	University level	as % of total
1970	967	735	76.0	202	21.0	29	3.0
1975	1,380	1,018	73.8	315	22.8	47	3.4
1980	2,154	1,523	70.7	545	25.3	86	4.0
1985	2,794	1,847	66.1	831	29.7	116	4.2
1986	2,945	1,919	65.1	904	30.7	124	4.2
1987	3,111	1,994	64.1	984	31.6	133	4.3
1988	3,284	2,071	63.1	1,070	32.6	143	4.3
		Percentage Annual Growth Rate					
1970-1980	8.3		7.6		10.4		11.0
1980-1985	5.4		3.9		8.8		7.2
1980-1987	5.4		3.9		8.8		7.2

Sources: See Table 1.

17. Indeed, University programmes of research and teaching that support the rehabilitation and further development of the agricultural sector are particularly important within the framework of the Lagos Plan of Action. Of equal importance to Africa's future is its capacity to plan and direct the process of development. To achieve this capacity, Africa's institutions of higher learning will have to produce manpower trained in the social science and management, conduct timely

research and provide advisory services in such fields as economic planning, finance, public administration, etc. In order to bring such a change and reorientation in education, particularly higher education, a start is imperative now in terms of concrete manpower policies and drastic revisions of school curricula.

III. The Impact of Structural Adjustment on Higher Education

III. The Impact of Structural Adjustment on Higher Education

(a) Eroding Skills Base

18. One of the most alarming trends noted by a number of papers, workshops and conferences with regard to this issue is that at the very time Africa's human capital is needed for economic recovery and development efforts, it is not being given the priority it deserves. In the conclusion of their joint paper, "Long-term Development and Structural change in Africa: Manpower Planning and Utilization", the ECA and ILO stated that: "Human resources in Africa today are denied the opportunity to make their full contribution to recovery and development. The African economic crisis and the stringency of SAPs have meant that a growing number of labour force canno be engaged in any productive activity particularly in the modern sector of the economy For instance, the skills base for development is being progressively weakened through the withdrawal of resources from higher education and through an acceleration of brain drain from the African Continent to the developed world" 8/ According to the ECA's estimates, this brain drain could signify a $12.6 billion loss to the African region over the next 25-35 years. A draft report tabled at a UNESCO-sponsored meeting on 26 September 1990 attributed to the slow pace of scientific development on the continent to the scarcity of its own scientists. The report suggested that, to retain highly qualified scientists and engineers, mechanisms be established to curb the brain drain in Africa.9/ Folowing the ECA paper, it has also been estimated that about 70,000 Africans with middle- and high-level skills had left the Continent by 1987, up from 40,000 in 1985. This represents almost 30% of the current stock of Africa's skilled human resources and it leaves a population of just under half a million with no more than 200,000 to provide the high-levels of skills required to meet all the requirements of development.

19. Several factors underlying human haemorrhaging have been described by ECA in its paper entitled: "An Enabling Environment to Retain Africa's High-level Manpower". ECA maintains that the present government attitudes towards human resources need to be more positive so as to enable Africa's human resources to operate effectively as the true catalysts of socio-economic development. A new trend is, however setting in, creating a hostile environment for Africans to work and live in; the declines in real wages, the increases in the cost of educational and other services, the freeze on salaries, the massive retrenchments from public services, etc,, are all SAP policies being implemented in varying degrees by most African governments. These policies have rendered life difficult for many and have induced a greater number of highly qualified skilled Africans to leave the Continent.

(b) A Spill-over Effect on the Quality of Primary, Secondary and Higher Education due to Brain Drain

20. To analyse SAP's effects on higher education and their direct impact on the quality of primary, secondary and higher education, it is necessary first to

ascertain how these programmes have had negative implications on higher education.

21. Paradoxically, several African countries in which graduate unemployment has become a costly social problem rely heavily on even more costly expatriate manpower in many sectors of their economies. For instance, it is estimated that a minimum of 80,000 resident non-national technical assistance personnel are currently working in the public sector of some 40 Sub-Saharan African countries at an annual cost of at least $4 billion.13/ Such contradictory trends are a function both of poor human resources planning, development and utilization policies in African countries and of the IMF/World Bank conditionalities and interests of donor assistance. Indeed, this is damaging both in the short- and in the long-run. It also helps to perpetuate the dependence on external assistance, despite the political will of governments to reform education systems and adapt them to the needs of economic growth.

22. Some of the unsalutary consequences brought by SAP packages which call for measures on wage restraint have eroded morale, motivation and efficiency of qualified teaching staff. Their working conditions in many cases are appailing with respect to the means to perform their tasks and the renumeration they receive. Indeed, salaries to high-level skilled manpower in most African countries have long ceased to have any meaning. In this connection, there was a catastrophic drop in real wages between 1980 and 1984 in the face of sharp price increases in many African countries. For instance, the real value of the monthly salary of a University professor in Sierra Leone was equivalent to $66; This was even much lower in the case of Ghana and Uganda during the same period. This being one of the major causes leading to a substantial number of trained personnel and professors to migrate in search of employment outside the Continent, the following have been the impact at all levels of education:

(i) Shortage of instructors in teachers' colleges. This has meant overcrowding in classrooms in most teachers' colleges (i.e., students/instructor ratio) resulting in poor quality of graduates completing their studies therefrom. Most African countries today also face a growing demand for the limited places in primary schools due to high population growth rate and cuts in public expenditure in education which has impeded the expansion of buildings. In this regard, overcrowding in primary schools is also prevalent. Taken together, poor quality of teachers graduating from teachers' colleges and overcrowding in primary schools (where these very teachers usually go after graduating) have contributed to an overall decline in the quality of education at the primary level. In Tanzania, for instance, shortage of teachers both in primary schools and teachers colleges in 1990 is 21% and 25% respectively.11/ In Malawi, pupil/teacher ratios increased from 60:1 to 70:1 between 1984/85 and 1988/89.12/

(ii) The quality of secondary school education in most African countries has also been low and possibly declining. The argument advanced in (i) above may as well explain the decline in the quality of secondary school education, but one major reason is that since it is the very pupils in primary level education who ultimately join secondary schools, one is led to accept that

there is a spill-over effect of poor quality of primary level education to secondary level education. Needless to mention that the quality of primary-level education is a sine qua non for the expected quality of secondary-level education.

(iii) That Africa will require not only literate and numerate citizens, but also highly qualified and trained people to perform top-quality research, formulate policies and implement programmes essential to economic growth and development in order to survive and compete in a competitive world in the 21st Century is a fact that has even been acknowledged by the World Bank.14/ The issues raised both in (i) and (ii) would imply that a declining quality of high-level education must be expected if nothing changes at the primary and secondary levels of education.

The exodus of high-level-skilled manpower from Africa implies that Africa should be prepared to expect low research outputs in the coming future. In some cases, it would be difficult for Africa to undertake high level research in some fields. This would make it even more difficult for many African countries to manage their economies. Poor university graduates (due to scarcity of teachers) implies poor teachers both at primary and secondary school levels of education.

23. Most high level professionals who have found it difficult to migrate have shifted to the informal sector within their countries. Thus, very many teachers and other public servants have been supplementing their meagre incomes by undertaking secondary income generation activities even during official working hours, or practising their professions for their own account.

(c) Poor Agricultural and Industrial Research

24. A greater application of technology would be required if Africa should retain growth in output of 4% a year over the medium and long-run. The slow development of new agricultural technologies in the past decade reflect the decline in the quality of agricultural research in Africa. Cuts in public expenditure in agricultural research institutions have constrained research output. Furthermore, the problem of the brain drain implies that in many African countries, fewer researchers have been spending less money attempting to producing good quality work. Needless to say their efforts have met with very limited success. While it is an urgent priority for Africa to rehabilitate its agricultural research institutions, and have then manned by results-oriented managers job dissatisfaction among agricultural scientists due to poor wages, undermine efforts in this direction. This is likely to affect agricultural productivity in most countries in the long-run. The importance of scientific and technical skills and know-how for modern development cannot be over emphasized. It is in this area that Africa is over dependent on imported technical and scientific manpower. It is therefore very cardinal, and in accordance with the principle of self-reliant, that Africa should give special priority to the development of scientific and technical manpower at all levels including agricultural scientists, industrialists, technicians, administrators, etc. Ironically, SAP policies calling for cut backs on higher education undermines the very

principles of Africa's struggle towards achieving such goals. The ultimate results have been de-industrialization of the entire continent and weakening the key research institutions.

(d) Rising unemployment

25. In many African countries, the public sector is the most important wage employer and often responsible for 50% or more of total wage employment. An international comparison of the importance of government employment has shown that public sector employment in some African countries is indeed important.15/ The study reported that public employment as a proportion of the labour force employed in the non-agricultural sector exceeded 50%; in Mauritius 53%; Liberia 60%; Ghana 74%; Tanzania 78%; Zambia 81% and Benin 87%. The share of public sector employees in non-agricultural wage employment was highest in Africa 54%, followed by Asia 36%, Latin America 27% and the OECD countries 24%.16/

26. It appears therefore, that the slow down in modern sector wage employment in recent years is essentially due to the fact that the public sector - as the engine of employment growth - has become increasingly unable to sustain high rates of labour absorption of the 1970s and 1980s. Instead, most countries have been forced to retrench public sector workers. Some studies have alleged that in the 1983-1985 period, 3 to 4 million jobs may have been lost as a consequence of SAPs policies in Africa.17/ In effect, the impact of SAPs on employment varies according to the policy instruments and measures adopted. Cuts in public expenditure, restriction of imports and exchange rate policies that change relative prices can cause transitory employment. When capital expenditure and investment are substantially reduced, a depression in aggregate labour demand results, thereby creating higher levels of unemployment. Expenditure reduction policies, implemented in situations where domestic demand is at or below full employment level, will tend to achieve short-run equilibrium in the external balance at the cost of lower input, lower employment and capacity utilization and lower incomes in the domestic economy.

27. As the employment markets have become tighter and more precarious under the crisis and Structural Adjustment programmes (SAPs) most graduates have found it difficult to find jobs both in private and especially, in the pubic sector. A disturbing trend in several African countries is that the unemployment rate for the educated tends to be higher than the rate for labour force with little or no formal education and in some instances is twice as high. For example, a tracer study of graduates in Nigeria in 1986 found that only 58% had full-time jobs 18 months after they had completed their mandatory national youth service. A high degree of underemployment and job dissatisfaction was also noted. 30% of the graduates found their education irrelevant for their jobs and 60% expressed their dissatisfaction with what they where doing18/. In fact, budget constraints are forcing many governments to abandon employment guarantee. Considering the amount of time and money it takes to educate a university graduates the fact that these graduate have not been able to secure full-time jobs after completing their study, represents a great loss to most African countries.

IV. Restructuring Structural Adjustment

28. There is now a consensus that a first step towards coming out of the present crisis is to "restructure" many of the SAPs African countries have been adapting in the past years. This was reflected in the Khartoum Declaration which identified several areas in which action should be taken by African governments and the international community in regard to these programmes.

29. Firstly, the Declaration insist that these programmes must be designed, implemented and monitored as part of the long-term framework of Africa's development and therefore must be compatible with the objectives and aspirations of the African people as outlined in the Lagos Plan of Action (LPA) and the Final Act of Lagos (FAL).

30. Secondly, the human dimension should be the fulcrum of adjustment programme. Thus the application of structural adjustment measures should restore, and not corrode the dignity of the African as a human being.

31. Thirdly, the structural adjustment policies must incorporate the relevant adjustments of the social sector.

32. Finally, if the ultimate objective of economic development is human well being, the entire process of monitoring stabilization and SAPs must incorporate the social aspects and criteria.

33. With regard to the question of mobilization of resources for educational development, ECA's position in Khartoum is as follows:

"African Governments should explore the possiblities of activating new sources of revenue generation for the education sector such as unleashing the income-generation potentials which educational institutions may have, sealing off the many sources of foreign exchange leakage in the education sector, strengthening internal capabilities so that a larger measure of self-reliance in education is attained; improving educational management capabilities so as to optimize the utilization of resources, space and time" 19/

34. By contrast, the World Bank's study on "Education in Sub-Saharan Africa" calls for cost-recovery through the application of user charges, cost-containment and greater private participation in the provision of higher education. It is against this background that ECA has argued that such policies would "most likely turn out to be self-defeating in that rather than enhance the development of education, they would weaken its effectiveness, militate against the skills development objectives of the region and promote education, especially at the middle and high levels, for the rich - those who can pay - while reinforcing the marginalization of the poor, who cannot" 20/ We are of the opinion that structural adjustment policies should be restructured to aim at education and making it relevant at all levels - primary, secondary and tertiary since the objectives at each level are all important to Africa's development. Since a new sprectrum of scientific and technological knowledge is unfolding outside the Continent, Africa will need to create top quality institutions to train scientists, engineers, technologists,

teachers, researchers, etc.; it will also need to significantly improve on the provision of post-graduate programmes especially in the disciplines crucial to Africa's development. Such objectives cannot be achieved when public resources are directed away from secondary and higher education towards primary education as is being advocated by SAPs of the IMF/World Bank. Rather than making cuts in public expenditure on education, governments could instead reduce expenditure on the non-productive sectors such as defence. This, would release resources for investiment, in say, higher education. It would also help to improve resource allocation.

V. Conclusion

35. This report has shown that SAPs have contributed negatively towards shaping the standard of higher education in Africa. Indeed, the very fact that the quality of higher education in Africa has declined of late in most African countries implies that both the quality of primary and secondary levels of education have declined as well. In fact, many of the economic principles and theories on which the IMF and World Bank policies and programmes are based are clearly wrong. They are based on a mixture of different conflicting theories - classical, keynesians, monetarists and neo-classical. The hybrid and eclectic theorizing mixes up paradigms resulting in policy confusion. For instance, SAPs price policies aimed at transmitting exchange rate movements through the economy, improving incentives, and encouraging a more efficient resource allocation have a number of negative results which have triggered off inflation leading to low and declining real wages, which in turn erodes the morale, motivation and efficiency of qualified and experienced Africans. The 1980s have witnessed the acceleration of the exodus of high level skilled manpower from Africa to developed countries. If this trend persists, Africa may begin the next millennium with a great proportion of its population being unskilled and/or of poor quality than it did at the beginning of the post-independence era in the early 1960s.

36. Since structural adjustment is intended to improve prospects for long-term development, the design and context of Structural Adjustment Programmes should incorporate the goals and objectives of long-term development. The orthodox structural adjustment programmes have failed in most cases because they do not tackle the fundamental structural distortions plaguing Africa's political economy, and because they overlook the Continent's needs to go far beyond adjustment. The Continent needs adjustment with transformation. Taking into account the structural weaknesses that lead to the perpetual emergence of crisis situations in most African countries, the path of adjustment with transformation should aim at simultaneously strengthening the process of generation, distribution and expenditure of national income. This the message of the African Alternative Framework to Structural Adjustment Programmes for Socio-economic Recovery and Transformation (AAFSAP) which was prepared by the ECA and endorsed by the Assembly of Heads of State and Government of the OAU and Non-Aligned Movement as well as the General Assembly of the United Nations.

37. Human resource development should be placed high on the strategic agenda for the 1990s for all African countries, thus reflecting a shared determination to reverse the decline witnessed, especially with regard to the quality of education during the past decade. This study therefore, urgently recommends that each nation now takes on the task of formulating and implementing an internally

coherent set of policies that reflect its unique history and aspirations and that effectively address its own recently exacerbated problems in education and training sector. In this regard, expansion of Africa's capacity to produce post-graduate intellectual talent to fill the highest scientific and technical jobs in education establishments, in governments and in the private sectors is an important priority to be addressed.

38. Donors should also see human resources development as a priority for Africa during this decade. The pressing requirement is for aid in support of policy reform. The international community should be ready to provide for an access to the ongoing experience of other developed countries in formulating and implementing policy reforms. In fact, intensive collaboration among all countries and the sharing of their accumulated experience would pay high dividends as countries grapple with common issues.

41. The proposed future development strategy elaborated in this report calls for more spending at all levels of education. The increases in public spending on education can be met partly by cuts elsewhere and partly by greater resource mobilization. As ECA has rightly argued, markedly lower outlays on military spending could yield important savings in many African countries.21/

40. African Governments should show greater interest in participating in the Joint ECA/IOM Return of Skills Programmes for Africa, for the promise it holds for assisting them in identifying highly qualified Africans in specialized field for employment in key areas. A greater involvement in this programme will obviate the need for hiring expensive expatriate personnel. But, again, the challenge will be to create economic growth which offers opportunities for the people to have received training at great expense. An enabling environment for these high level skilled manpower is a pre-condition of the success of any attempt to reverse the brain drain.

References

Ali, A. and T. Eshete (1990): Education in Ethiopia: Country Report Prepared for the curriculum Development course held in the Gambia. 6th August-17th September 1990.

Balassa, B. (1982): 'Structural Adjustment Policies in Developing Countries'. World Development, Vol. 10, No.1 pp.23-38.

Chamwali P.A., and J.M. Nkongo (1990): 'A Report on Education in Tanzania'. Paper presented at Aco Curriculum Development Course held at Banjul, the Gambia. 6 August - 16 September 1990.

Chinafric (1990): Trial Issue No. 4, November.

ECA/IBRD (1987): Education Policies for Sub-Saharan Africa. (comments by ECA on the Discussion Draft by the World Bank). Nazareth, Ethiopia, 28-30 January 1987.

ECA (1988a): "Long-term Development and Structural Change in Africa: Manpower Planning and Utilization". (ECA/ICHD/88/32).

ECA (1988b): The Khartoum Declaration on the Human Dimensions of Africa's Economic Recovery and Development, Khartoum, 6-8 March 1988.

ECA (1988c): Employment Generation, Productivity Enhancement and Co-operation in the Use of High-Level Manpower. E/ECA/PAMM/HRP/88/9.

Federal Republic of Nigeria (1988): Report of Graduate Employment Trace Study 1986: National Manpower Board. Manpower Studies No. 24, Lagos.

Hansen, W.L. and B. Weisbrod (1969); Benefits, costs and Finance of Public Higher Education. (Chicago: Markham).

Helleiner, G.K. (ed.) (1986): 'Uganda: Contradictions of the IMF Programmes and Perspectives' in Development and Change, Vol. 21, No.3, pp.427-467.

Heller, P. and A. Tait (1984): Government Employment and Pay: International Comparisons. IMF Occasional Paper No. 24, Washington D.C.

IFAD (1988): Human Resources, Structural Adjustment and the Development of Smallholders and Rural Poor. Rome.

ILO/WEP (1989): African Employment Report 1988 JASPA. Addis Ababa.

Marin A. and G. Psacharopoulos (1976): 'Schooling and Income Distribution'. Review of Economics and Statistics, August. pp.332-338.

Malunda H.J. and B.M. Kanjala (1990): 'Malawi: Country Report on Education for the African Curriculum Organization Course'. Banjul, Gambia, 6th August - 17th September 1990.

Ndegwa, P. (1989) 'National Policies for Balanced and Sustainable Development in the Poor Countries: How to Avoid Involuntary Delinking', In Development Journal of the Society for International Development. No.1, pp.11-18

Neizer R.A. and J. Sakara (1990) Country Report on Education in Ghana. Curriculum Development Course 1990. Banjul, Gambia. 6th August - 17th September 1990.

Nawzad, B. (1981): The IMF and its Critics: Essay in International Finance. No.146 (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University).

OAU (1981): The Lagos Plan of Action for the Development of Africa 1980-2000 (Geneva: International Institute for Labour Studies).

The IMF/World Bank (1987): 'Report on a Conference on The Impact of the IMF/World Bank Policies on the People of Africa', City University, London, 7-11 September 1987.

UNDP (1990): Human Development Report 1990. Oxford University Press. Oxford.

United Nations (1988a): Human Resources for Africa's Recovery and Development: An Overview. E/ECA/PAMM/HRP/TC/88/11, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

United Nations (1988b): The Khartoum Declaration. Khartoum, Sudan.

United Nations (1988c) Survey of Economic and Social Conditions in Africa 1986-1987. E/ECA/CM.14/4/Rev.1

UN/ECA (1989a): African Alternative Framework to Structural Adjustment Programmes for Socio-Economic Recovery and Transformation (AAF-SAP). E/ECA/CM.15/6/Rev.3, Addis Ababa.

United Nations (1989b) Handbook for Manpower Planners in Africa. ECA/PHSD/HRP/89/26[6.1(iii)(a)], Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

United Nations (1990): Survey of Economic and Social Conditions in Africa, 1987-1988. E/ECA/CM.15/3/Rev.2, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

World Bank (1981): Accelerated Development for Sub-Saharan Africa: An Agenda for Action. Washington D.C.

World Bank (1988): Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization and Expansion, Washington D.C.

World Bank (1989): Sub-Saharan Africa: from Crisis to Sustainable Growth, Washington D.C.

World Bank (1990): World Development Report 1990. Oxford University Press, Oxford.

NOTES

1. Th e Principal objectives of 'Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) are to assist countries to restore external and internal imbalances in their economies, and to re-establish a process of economic growth which will be consistent with macro-economic equilibria. We shall use the terms 'structural adjustment' and 'recovery' programmes interchangeably.

2. X-inefficiency is the term given to denote general managerial and technological inefficiency.

3. See ECA/IBRD (1987), World Bank (1988) Malunda and Kanjala (1990), UNDP (1990), United Nations (1990), World Bank (1990), Neizer and Sakara (1990) and, Ali and Eshete (1990).

4. See Helleiner (1986), The IMF/World Bank (1987), United Nations (1990) and Mamdani (1990).

5. See World Bank (1988).

6. See World Bank (1989:24).

7. See World Bank (1988).

8. ECA (1988a).

9. See Chinafric (1990).

10. See ECA (1988c).

11. See Chamwali and Nkongo (1990:12).

12. See Malunda and Kanjala (1990:40).

13. See IFAD (1988) and United Nations (1989:5)

14. World Bank (1989:81).

15. See Heller and Tait (1984).

16. Most of the data refer to the period 1979-81.

17. ECA (1988).

18. See, Federal Republic of Nigeria (1989).

19. See E/ECA/PAMM/HRP/TC/88/11.

20. Ibid.

21. UN/ECA (1989a).

Distribution of Public Current Expenditure on Education and Enrolment in selected African Countries

Countries	Year	Primary		Secondary		Higher	
		Percentage		Percentage		Percentage	
		Budget	Enrolment	Budget	Enrolment	Budget	Enrolment
Botswana	1983	43.0	88.1	29.1	11.1	23.7	0.8
Burundi	1981	38.8	90.2	35.3	8.9	23.8	0.9
Burkina Faso	1983	31.4	87.6	16.6	11.3	25.9	1.1
Guinea	1984	30.8	72.0	36.9	25.3	23.5	2.7
Lesotho	1983	39.7	89.2	35.1	10.1	19.5	0.7
Malawi	1983	40.9	97.0	14.8	2.6	27.3	0.4
Mali	1982	43.5	79.9	22.3	13.5	18.7	1.6
Niger	1981	36.8	83.3	46.2	16.0	17.0	0.7
Rwanda	1983	78.2	97.9	-	1.9	12.7	0.2
Sudan	1980	48.0	78.0	31.0	20.5	20.7	1.5
Uganda	1982	16.3	91.4	55.7	8.2	17.5	0.4

Source: United Nations (1990): Survey of Economic and Social Conditions in Africa 1987-1988. E/ECA/CM.15/3/Rev.2, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Table IV.3, p.26.